## IN THE HIGH COURT OF SOUTH AFRICA GAUTENG DIVISION, PRETORIA

CASE NO: $15797 / 22$

In the matter between:

## THE NATIONAL LOTTERIES COMMISSION

Applicant
and

THE MINISTER OF TRADE, INDUSTRY
AND COMPETITION
First Respondent

## THE BOARD OF THE NATIONAL LOTTERIES

 COMMISSIONSecond Respondent

## FIRST RESPONDENT'S EXPLANATORY AFFIDAVIT

I, the undersigned

## MOOSA EBRAHIM

do hereby state under oath as follows:

1 I currently serve as Chief Director in the office the Minister of Trade, Industry and Competition ("the Minister").

2 The Minister is responsible for the administration of the Lotteries Act 57 of 1997 ("the Lotteries Act" or "the Act") and for the oversight of the

National Lotteries Commission ("the NLC" or "the Commission"), the applicant in these proceedings.

By virtue of my position, I am duly authorised to depose to this affidavit and to oppose the application before this court.

4 The facts in this affidavit are, unless otherwise stated or the contrary appears from the context, within my personal knowledge, and are both true and correct. Where I make legal submissions, I do so on the strength of legal advice obtained from my legal representatives, whose advice । accept to be correct.

5 I have read the applicant's notice of motion and the founding affidavit deposed to by Ms Thabang Mampane ("the Commissioner"). The application and relief sought stand opposed for the reasons set out below.

6 The purpose of this affidavit is to provide a factual account of what has transpired both prior to the institution of this application, and thereafter. These factual events have a bearing on the order sought by the Commissioner, in that the matter has effectively become moot.

## PRELIMINARY FACTS AND DEVELOPMENTS IN THE CASE

7 The Commissioner seeks an order directing the Minister to:
7.1 take "all reasonable steps to ensure that the [NLC] has a quorate board after 31 March 2022";
7.2 report to the Court by 31 March 2022 that "necessary" steps have been taken to give effect to the order set out in paragraph 7.1 above; and
7.3 in the alternative, extend the terms of the current members of the board, pending the finalisation of the appointment of a new board.

The basis for the institution of these proceedings, as pleaded by the Commissioner, is firstly that the process for the appointment of the new board "has not even commenced". In addition, the Commissioner asserts that the Minister has "[failed] to initiate the process of selecting new Board members" and that the "failure of action on [my] part to secure a valid Board by 1 April exposes the [NLC] and the Board to the risk of harm."

The Commissioner's contentions are factually incorrect, and she knows this to be so. At the time of the institution of this application, there were measures already in place to ensure that a new board is appointed by 31 March 2022. The Department of Trade, Industry and Competition ("the Department") issued an invitation for nominations of, and applications by, suitable members of the public to serve on the NLC Board on 13 February 2022, with a closing date of 7 March 2022. This information is in the public domain, as the invitation was widely disseminated. The Commissioner knew of this, and the fact that applications had closed, when she launched this application. A copy of the advertisement is attached, marked "ME1".

In response to the invitation, the Department received over 100 (one hundred) nominations and applications, which have been scrutinized and evaluated since 7 March 2022. The Minister also applied his mind to
identify persons with the necessary skills, experience and integrity to serve as members of the Board.

Moreover, the Commissioner cites the decision of the Minister to instruct the Department's legal representatives to initiate the process of terminating the services of the current members of the NLC board, as communicated to the National Assembly during the Minister's address at its sitting on 8 March 2022, as a basis for the relief sought.

15 The Minister communicated this decision to the National Assembly after the Special Investigating Unit ("the SIU") presented the findings of its investigation into the affairs of the NLC to the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry ("the Portfolio Committee"). The presentation to the Portfolio Committee revealed widespread corruption in the awarding of grants by the NLC, which involved a senior official in the NLC, and former members of the board.

These facts are omitted from the Commissioner's affidavit. Instead, she seeks in the alternative, an order that the terms of the current members of the Board be extended.

17 The decision to institute the process to terminate the terms of the current Board members is a legitimate response to the evidence of corruption and maladministration revealed in the SIU's presentation to the Portfolio Committee. This presentation revealed, amongst others, that millions of rands were disbursed by the NLC for worthy causes, but that the funds disbursed were not used for their intended purpose.

18 The process for the termination of the services of the current members of the Board is currently being carried out in accordance with section 3(5) of the Lotteries Act, and the members of the Board have been afforded an opportunity to make representations to the Minister on why their membership of the Board should not be terminated. It would thus be irregular to extend the terms of appointment of the board at least until that process is finalized. $3(5)$ of the Lotteries Act was communicated after the closing date for nominations and applications and did not detract from the efforts and measures which were then in place to ensure that a Board is appointed when the current Board's tenure expires. In terms of section 3 of the Lotteries Act, the responsibility for the appointment of members to the Board is assigned to the Minister, and the Minister determines the period for which a member shall hold office on the Board. Although a member of the Board may be eligible for reappointment on the expiry of her or his first terms of office in terms of section 3(4), the decision to re-appoint falls within the discretion of the Minister.

On 7 March 2022, the SIU briefed the Portfolio Committee on its investigation into the affairs of the NLC. The SIU briefing revealed that the SIU had evidence of corruption and maladministration, particularly in the awarding of grants to non-profit organisations by the NLC. In order to avoid unnecessary prolix, and so as not to burden the Court, the presentation is not attached. A copy can be made available to the Court if required.

23 Following these revelations, the Minister addressed the National Assembly on 8 March 2022. In that address, he communicated the decision to instruct the Department's legal representatives to initiate the process of terminating the terms of the remaining member of the Board. This is so because the acts of corruption as detailed in the SIU's presentation occurred during their term of office.

24 This application was launched shortly after the announcement by the Minister to the National Assembly on 11 March 2022.

The office of the Minister then addressed a letter to the Commissioner on 16 March 2022, in terms of which she was advised of the steps already taken in the process of appointing a new Board and invited her to withdraw the application. In the correspondence addressed to the Commissioner, it was pointed out that:
25.1 the allegation that the process for the appointment of new members of the board has not even commenced was unsubstantiated;
25.2 it was regrettable that the Commissioner decided to institute litigious proceedings without having engaged the office of the Minister to obtain an update on progress in the appointment process, her last communication to the Minister in this regard having been sent on 18 January 2022, and launched the application without considering which was in the public domain;
25.3 the NLC sought an order in terms of which the terms of the current members of the Board are extended, notwithstanding the revelations
of corruption and maladministration in the awarding of grants by the NLC during the current Board's term, as detailed in the report presented by the SIU to the Portfolio Committee;
25.4 the NLC's decision to institute these proceedings without prior notification to the Minister and to seek the extension of the terms of the current members of the Board, did not assist in fostering public confidence in the governance of the NLC;
25.5 the Minister was extensively engaged in taking the steps necessary to appoint a new Board and, in addition, to implement appropriate actions in response to the interim report of the SIU revealing widespread corruption in the NLC, including by former members of the Board and an official of the NLC;
25.6 the application has been instituted prematurely, and on a flawed understanding of the facts, which would have been avoided had the NLC engaged the office of the Minister before approaching the Court;
25.7 the Minister was fully aware that the terms of the current members of the Board expire on 31 March 2022, and that the Department had taken steps to ensure that there is no interregnum after the expiry of the current members' terms of office on 31 March 2022;
25.8 the allegation in the founding affidavit that the process to be followed in the appointment of a new board has not commenced, which
appears to form the basis of her apprehension, was not factually correct;
25.9 the invitation for nominations of, and applications by, suitable members of the public to serve on the NLC Board was published and circulated on 13 February 2022, and the closing date for nominations and applications was 7 March 2022. It was further indicated that the Department received a large number of applications and nominations, which had been scrutinized and evaluated since 7 March, before the institution of this application;
25.10 The appointment process was well under way, and the Minister was taking such steps to enable the timeous appointment of a new Board;
25.11 the institution of litigation in this manner was consistent with a trend for the NLC to devote resources to expensive and counterproductive litigation. It was further indicated that rather than working with the office of the Minister to investigate and prevent corruption at the NLC and prevent the abuse of beneficiary funds, the NLC had chosen not to cooperate with a forensic investigation that he had authorised, and instead went to Court to argue that the Minister did not have the power to order forensic investigations into the misappropriation of NLC funds. Further, that the NLC has persisted with this uncooperative attitude despite the findings of the SIU as to extensive corruption and misappropriation of funds, including by former of members of the Board and an official of the NLC;
28.1 in the correspondence, the Commissioner refers to various matters that are irrelevant to this application, in support of the contention that she approached this Court because of the Minister's repeated failure to respond to correspondence from the NLC on this issue;
28.2 the Commissioner, in paragraph 3 of her letter, refers to various letters addressed to the Minister, which she states were not responded to. One of these letters relates to the appointment of members of a distributing agency. The other is a letter in terms of which the Minister was simply notified, without more, that Dr Madzivhandila had passed away. These matters are irrelevant to the issue before Court;
28.3 she mentions that she became aware of the advertisement calling for applications and nominations for members of the NLC Board by reading the newspaper;

28.4 further, she refers to the non-appointment of a Chairperson of the Board, when it is a matter of public record that this process is currently being considered by the National Assembly; and
28.5 resultantly, and after having realised that processes were in place to ensure the appointment of the Board, she suggested that the Minister consent to a proposed draft order compelling him to appoint a Board by 31 March 2022.

On 18 March 2022, the Department's attorneys of record addressed a letter to the Commissioner's attorneys, in terms of which they were advised that the Minister would soon be making appointments to the Board and requesting that they agree to a deferral of the hearing of the application to afford him the time to make appointments to the Board. This suggestion was rejected by the Commissioner's attorneys. The letter from the Department's attorneys is attached, marked "ME4", and the letter from the Commissioner's attorneys is attached as "ME5".

In response to the Commissioner's correspondence dated 17 March 2022, the Minister indicated the following on 19 March 2022:
32.1 The reasons why the Minister had not been able to appoint a Chairperson - which were that Parliament is yet to make a recommendation to the Minister - were a matter of public record, and was in any event not referred to in the Commissioner's founding affidavit;
32.2 the non-appointment of the NLC Chairperson was evidently included in the letter as a disingenuous attempt to justify the insistence that the Minister agree to a court order;
32.3 as Executive Authority, the Minister is not constrained in respect of the appointment of normal Board members, as he is in relation to the appointment of the Chairperson;
32.4 the letter makes it clear that she had been aware of the advertisement and that the closing date had already passed, when she proceeded to launch this application, without referring to this material fact in her founding affidavit for the attention of the Court;
32.5 she was aware that the Minister had taken certain actions and chose to ignore them, and that it was clear from her letter that there was no factual or legal basis for approaching the Court on an urgent basis on 11 March 2022.

The letter to the Commissioner, dated 19 March 2022, is attached and marked "ME6".

34 On 23 March 2022, The Department's attorneys addressed a letter to the Commissioner's attorneys, in terms of which they were informed that the Minister would make appointments to the Board that evening, and that the terms of the new appointees would commence on 24 March 2022. The Commissioner's attorneys were also invited to withdraw the application. A copy of this letter is attached, marked "ME7"

In line with this, and the indication recorded in the letter from the Minister dated 16 March 2022, the Minister addressed a letter to the Commissioner, in terms of which he advised the Commissioner that:
35.1 he had appointed three persons to the Board, in terms of section 3(1)(c) of the Act; and
35.2 he had appointed one person to the Board, in terms of section 3(1)(b) of the Lotteries Act.

36 This letter from the Minister to the Commissioner, dated 23 March 2022, is attached, marked "ME8".

37 I am advised that there issues before this court have become moot and that in seeking the alternative order that the terms of the current members of the Board be extended, the Commissioner effectively invites the Court to limit the Minister's powers to exercise discretion in appointing members of the Board. This is an extreme step that should be exercised with extreme caution by courts.

In addition, it is impermissible for the Commissioner to seek to determine members of the Board to which she is accountable in accordance with
section $2 \mathrm{~B}(1)$ (a). That decision falls entirely within the remit of the Minister, for good reason - the Board is required to advise, and make recommendations to, the Minister on the various matters set out in section 10 of the Lotteries Act. It is also for the Minister to terminate the membership of any member of the Board on good cause shown, in accordance with section 33 of the Constitution. It is not for the Commissioner to seek to determine who should be appointed to the Board.

I am advised that the Courts have made it clear that structural interdicts should not be granted unless it is necessary for the Court to do so. The Commissioner has not pointed to any factual basis for the assertion that the Minister have failed to ensure that the process for the appointment of a new Board is initiated. In fact, the opposite is true - that process was well under way when these proceeding were instituted and has since been concluded. The Commissioner knows this. Accordingly, the relief of a structural interdict is completely unnecessary in this case.

## CONTEXTUAL BACKGROUND

40 This is the third in a series of applications launched by the NLC against the Minister in his official capacity as the Executive Authority responsible for the operation of the Lotteries Act and the NLC.

41 In the first application, launched by the former Chairperson of the Board under case number: 3115/20, the NLC sought an order declaring unlawful the Minister's decision to authorise the institution of an investigation into allegations of corruption in the NLC. This Court, per Neukircher J, held
that the Minister has the power to authorise such an investigation, and dismissed the NLC's application for leave to appeal that judgment. The NLC has now applied for leave to appeal to the Supreme Court of Appeal.

42 The second application, launched by the Commissioner under case number: 11706/21, related to the Minister's decision to appoint an acting Chairperson for the Board, following the expiry of the term of Prof. Alfred Nevhutanda.

43 Now, in these proceedings, the Commissioner seeks an order that encompasses a directive that the Minister extend the tenure of the current NLC Board. This is the body that she functionally reports to.

44 At the time of the Minister's appointment to the Trade, Industry and Competition portfolio in May 2019, the NLC Board was comprised of the following persons:
44.1 Prof Alfred Nevhutanda as the Chairperson of the Board;
44.2 Adv William Huma as the legal practitioner contemplated in section 3(1)(c) of the Lotteries Act;
44.3 Ms Doris Dondur as a chartered accountant as contemplated in section 3(1)(c);
44.4 Prof YN Gordhan, a chartered accountant;
44.5 Ms Zandile Brown, the ministerial appointee contemplated in section 3(1)(b); and
44.6 Dr MA Madzivhandila, an ordinary member with proven business acumen or applicable knowledge or experience in relation to the functions of the board, as contemplated in section 3(1)(c).

45 These members of the Board were appointed by the former Minister, Dr Rob Davies.

46 In November 2020, Prof Nevhutanda's term of office expired, and was not extended.

47 Adv William Huma resigned from the Board on 4 October 2021, after the Minister addressed a letter to him, in terms of which he informed Adv Huma of his intention to terminate his membership of the board and requested that he make representations on why he should not be removed as a member of the Board. This decision was based on findings made by the SIU that Adv Huma unlawfully benefitted an amount of approximately R15 554600 from grants paid by the NLC to various NPOs, both before and during his tenure as a member of the Board.

48 Dr Madzivhandila passed away in January 2022 and left a vacancy on the Board.

## CONCLUSION

49 In light of the Minister's decision to appoint additional 4 ("four") members to the Board, it is submitted that the relief sought by the Commissioner has been rendered academic.

However, notwithstanding the academic nature of the dispute, the Commissioner was aware at the time that this application was launched, that a process was in place to appoint members of the Board. The Commissioner did not disclose this fact to the Court, and instead misled the Court by asserting that no steps had been taken to ensure that a Board is appointed by 1 April 2022, knowing this to be untrue.

51 The Commissioner has further been provided with several opportunities to withdraw this application and has refused. In the circumstances, it is submitted that the application be struck off the roll, with costs.


THUS SIGNED AND SWORN TO before me at $\qquad$ on the $24 T \mathrm{H}$ of MARCH 2022, the deponent having acknowledged that he knows and understands the contents of this affidavit, has no objection to taking the prescribed oath and considers the oath binding on his conscience.


## "ME1

## Depanment

Trade Indusiry arid Competion
REPUBLIC OF SOUTH AFRICA
THE DEPARTMENT OF TRADE, INDUSTRY
AND COMPETITION (the dtic)
INVITATION FOR THE NOMINATION OF, OR APPLICATION BY, SUITABLE CANDIDATES FOR APPOINTMENT TO THE BOARD OF THE NATIONAL LOTTERIES COMMISSION

The Minister of Trade, Industry and Competition, Ebrahim Patel hereby invites nominations by individuals, organisations, institutions and civil society structures for suitable candidates, or applications by ind viduals, for appointment to the Board of the National Lotteries Commission (NLC).
The Lotteries Act, 1997 (Act No 57 of 1997) (the Act), as amended, established the NLC to monitor the operation of the national lottery and to oversee the distribution of a percentage of lottery proceeds for the benefit of society, in accordance with the provisions of the Act. A Board governs the operation of the NLC.
In terms of section 3(1) (b) of the Act, the Minister seeks to appont five persons who have proven business acumen or applicable knowledge or experience regarding matters connected with the functions of the board as members to serve for a period of five years At least one member so appointed must be a legal practitioner admitted to practice in the Republic and at least one must be a chartered accountant in the Republic.
Nominations/applications must contain:

- In the case of nominations, the full name, address and contact numbers of the person and/or organisation making the nomination and a signed acceptance of the nommation by the nominee
- A Curriculum Vitae of the nominee/applicant providing the following information: Full name, ID number and gender; latest postal address, contact and email; previous experience quoting dates and organisations, or institutions concerned, academic. qualifications and other directorships
- Certified copy of RSA Identity Document and certified copies of relevant qualifications.
- Any other information that may be of assistance to the Minister in considering whether the person has the requisite business acumen or applicable knowledge or experience,
- A declaration made under oath or by affirmation to the Minister in terms of section 38 of the Act in which the nominee/applicant declares that he or she is not disqualified from appointment as contemplated in section $3 A$ of the Act.

Further Considerations: Background verification, including criminal record and citizenship checks, will form part of the selection process - It is the nominee's responsbility to have foreign qualifications verified by the South African Qualifications Authority (SAQA) - Nominees/applicants will be contacted only if they have been short-listed

Nominations of and applications by people with disabilities are encouraged - Appointments to the Board will take account of gender, age, geographical spread, and demographic, representation - The Department reserves the right to source additional candidates for consideration
Applicants and nominess who are in any way conflicted or who refuse to comply with the confidentielty and restraint recibrements in the relevant provisions of the Act will be disqualified from appointment
The following forms, which are obtainable from the dtic website at (http//www.thedti.gov.za), must be completed and submitted:

- A signed and completed nomination and acceptance form (Form 1 A);
- A signed and completed form relating to the particulars of the nominee/applicant (form B);
- A written disclosure of business interests and membership of other boards/committees/ bodies, and
- A written consent to probity testing.

Nominations/Applications must be emailed to NIPNEDCuianseonsuking. $\varepsilon .=$ OR posted to The Director, Tiana Business Consulting Services (Pty) Ltd, PO Box 31821, Braamfontein, 2017. (NB: The words "Nomination/Application: National Lotteries Commission Board" must appear in the subject line of the e-mail or on the envelope). Please note that only short-listed candidates will be contacted, and if you have not heard from us within three (3) months of submitting your nomination, please consider it unsuccessful.
Enquiries re the position: Paul Mokhonoana - Tel 0123941217 or PMokhonoana@thedtic.gov.za
Enquities re the application process: Mkhuselen Mhlanga - Tel- fill 4311354 or mkhuselenim@tianaconsulting.co.za

## Ms Thabang Mampane <br> Commissioner <br> National Lotteries Commission

Dear Ms Mampane

## RE: URGENT APPLICATION ON BOARD APPOINTMENT

1 I refer to the urgent application launched in the High Court by the National Lotteries Commission ("NLC"), on your instruction as the Commissioner, in terms of which you seek an order directing me to take steps to ensure that the NLC has a quorate board after 31 March 2022, and further directing me to report to the Court before that date, that I have taken the necessary steps to give effect to the order.

2 I note that in the alternative, you seek an order directing me to extend the terms of the current members of the board, pending the finalisation of the appointment of new members of the board.

3 In substantiation of the order you seek in the High Court, you make the unsubstantiated allegation that the process of appointing new members of the board has not even commenced.

4 I have previously indicated in correspondence to the Board that it is crucial that public confidence is maintained in the operations of the NLC. The manner in which this matter is sought to be addressed, in Court, is regrettable. This is so because the NLC, on your instructions, decided to institute litigious proceedings without having engaged my office to obtain an update on progress in the appointment process and without having taken into account information which is in the public domain. To the best of my knowledge, you had last communicated with me on 18 January 2022.

5 In addition, the NLC seeks an order in terms of which the terms of office of the current members of the Board are extended, notwithstanding the revelations of corruption, maladministration and possible criminality in the awarding of grants by the NLC during the current Board's term, as detailed in the report presented by the Special Investigating Unit ("SIU") to the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry on 2 March 2022. As I set out below, I am currently in the process of providing these members with an opportunity to make representations to me.

[^0]

The NLC's decision to institute these proceedings without prior notification to either me or my office and to seek the extension of the terms of the current members of the Board, does not assist in fostering public confidence in the governance of the NLC.

It will not be possible for me to meet the deadline unreasonably and unliterally imposed by the NLC in its notice of motion, and if necessary, I will bring an application for the condonation.

9 As this letter makes clear, I am extensively engaged in taking the steps necessary to appoint a new Board and, in addition, to implement appropriate actions in response to the interim report of the SIU revealing widespread corruption in the NLC, including by former members of the Board and an official of the NLC. I am further mindful of the need to ensure a channel of communication with the NLC and will make proposals in this regard, later in this letter.

10 What exacerbates the situation is that the application has been instituted prematurely, and on a flawed understanding of the facts. This would have been avoided had the NLC engaged my office before approaching the Court.

11 I am fully aware that the terms of the current members of the Board expire 31 March 2022. In this regard, the Department has taken steps to ensure that there is no interregnum after the expiry of the current members' terms of office on 31 March 2022.

12 The allegation in the founding affidavit that the process to be followed in the appointment of a new board has not commenced, which appears to form the basis of your apprehension, is not factually correct and I briefly describe the steps that have been, and are being, taken by the Department on my instructions, below.

13 The invitation for nominations of, and applications by, suitable members of the public to serve on the NLC Board was published and circulated on 13 February 2022, and the closing date for nominations and applications was 7 March 2022. The Department received a large number of applications and nominations, which have been scrutinized and evaluated since 7 March. In addition, I have applied my mind to identify persons with the necessary skills, experience and integrity to serve as members of the Board and, in particular, to ensure that the future governance of the NLC is not compromised by widespread corruption and misappropriation of funds, as has been identified most recently in the report of the SIU tabled to the Parliamentary Portfolio Committee on 2 March 2022 and widely reported in the media.

14 Accordingly, there is no basis for an order directing me to comply with my statutory obligations. The appointment process is well under way, and I am taking such steps to enable the timeous appointment of a new board.

In choosing a new Board, I am mindful of the fact that the SIU report has found evidence that several former members of the Board used their position as board members to enrich themselves unlawfully at the expense of the good causes for which NLC funds are intended. I am further mindful of the fact that the NLC and its board refused to cooperate with, and sought to block, investigations initiated by myself and my predecessor aimed at preventing this widespread misappropriation of funds and, indeed, embarked on policies aimed at concealing this misappropriation. The NLC and its Board is continuing to this day with this trend to conceal by refusing, since August 2021 and without any legal basis, to provide me with a copy of a forensic investigation that it commissioned at considerable public expense.

16 The institution of litigation in this manner is consistent with a trend for the NLC to devote resources to expensive and counter-productive litigation. In particular, rather than working with me to investigate and prevent corruption at the NLC and prevent the abuse of beneficiary funds, the NLC chose not to cooperate with a forensic audit that I authorised and went to Court to argue that I, as Minister, did not have the power to order forensic investigations into the misappropriation of NLC funds. The NLC has persisted with this uncooperative attitude despite the findings of the SIU as to extensive corruption and misappropriation of funds, including by former of members of the Board and an official of the NLC.

17 I note that on 10 March 2022, Senior Counsel briefed by the NLC argued that the judgment by the Gauteng High Court upholding the Minister's power to institute investigations into NLC-linked corruption should be taken on appeal to either a full bench of the High Court or the Supreme Court of Appeal. Fortunately, this argument was again rejected by the High Court.

18 I now deal with the position of the current members of the Board. In the light of the conclusion of the SIU report, I have provided the current board members appointed in terms of section 3 (1)(c) with an opportunity to make written and/ or oral representations as to why I should not:
18.1 under section $3 A(2)$, conclude that they are not suitable persons to continue acting as a non-executive member of the board of the NLC; and
18.2 terminate their membership of the board of the NLC in accordance with the provisions of sections $3(5)$ (a) of the Act.

In doing so, I am following the process set out in the Act and according these members the full rights of audi alteram partem before I make a decision on their continued membership of the Board. I provided these members with an opportunity until close of business on Thursday, 17 March 2022 to make written representations and have arranged for one of my legal representatives to receive oral representations on my

[^1]behalf on Wednesday, 16 March 2022 should the members avail themselves of this opportunity. I am currently in correspondence with these members.

20 I am fully aware of the responsibilities that I have under the Lotteries Act to ensure the appointment of a Board that satisfies the statutory requirements and that has members with the integrity and experience to perform the board's fiduciary duties in a manner that restores public confidence in the NLC and are able to ensure that the patterns of corruption and misappropriation of funds that have dogged the NLC for many years are stopped and appropriate action is taken against all persons who have improperly benefited from NLC funds, which have been unscrupulously diverted from good causes.

21 In order to ensure that there is a sufficient communication between the Ministry and the NLC, I invite the Commissioner to contact Mr Moosa Ebrahim to establish an ongoing line of communication concerning the appointment of a new Board for the NLC and other matters of mutual interest.

22 In the light of the above, kindly advise me as a matter of urgency whether you intend to persist with your legal action.

Yours sincerely

NATIOMAL LOTTERES COMMISSIOM
a member of the dtic group

# MINISTER EBRAHIM PATEL 

DEPARTMENT OF TRADE, INDUSTRY AND COMPETITION
DTI CAMPUS
BLOCK A, FLOOR 3
77 MEINTJIES STREET
SUNNYSIDE
PRETORIA

17 March 2022

## BY EMAIL:

Dear Minister,

## URGENT APPLICATION ON BOARD APPOINTMENT

1. I refer to your letters dated 16 March 2022 and even date.
2. I do not intend addressing each aspect raised in your letters under reply to ad seriatim and my failure to do so should not be construed as admission of the correctness thereof but in fact the opposite. I reserve the right to do so at a later stage in the correct forum
3. As you are aware, I have the statutory obligation to ensure that there is a functioning Board. The application before court is inspired by lack of communication from the Ministry. It is accordingly my contention that there has never been an open line of communication when one looks at the history of previous correspondence from the NLC to the Minister. To this effect I outline below some of the previous correspondence addressed to the Minister which responses were never received:

MATIOMAL LOTTERIES COMMISSION
a member of the dtic group
3.1 7 February 2022 - Notice of Bereavement: Dr MA Madzivhandila
3.2 18 Jan 2022 - Letter to the Minister regarding the term of office of the Board
3.3 11 November 2021 - Letter to the President seeking intervention on the nonresponsiveness and critical matters submitted to the Minister which have been ignored.
3.4 12 March 2021 - Letter from the NLC Chairperson to the Minister listing all the outstanding matters that are critical to the sustainability of the NLC that require the Minister's urgent attention and requesting that the Minister initiate the process of recruiting new members for the office of Arts, Culture and National Heritage Sector Distributing Agency.
3.5 26 Jan 2021 - Letter from the NLC Board to the Minister referring to the contents of the letter dated 26 November 2020, requesting the Minister's inputs to the RFP document and authorisation for the Board to commence the Fourth Licence Application. Furthermore, emphasising the importance of meeting the Licence Application process milestones for a smooth and timeous transition from the Third Lottery Licence to the Fourth Lottery Licence.
4. The above letters outlined in paragraph 3.1 to 3.5 supra is not an exhaustive list of all correspondence that was sent to the Minister and remain unanswered. The absence of a response to these letters left me with no choice but to approach the Court on an urgent basis given the limited time frames within which the Minister must appoint a Board. I pause to mention that recruitment of a Board Member and Chairperson of the Board on or about September 2020. Whilst the publishing of recruitment of the respective vacant positions was made in September 2020 the same was not communicated by the Minister beforehand, during the process and to date. No update regarding the vacancies were given by the Minister. The recruitment process thereof was not communicated to the NLC.
5. It is common cause that the Minister did not even inform the NLC that he is advertising the positions of the Board to which the advertisement closed 7 March 2021. This information only came to my attention after reading the newspaper advertisement. The NLC was not advised that you are publishing an invitation to the public.
6. During 2020, the Minister stated in Court papers that he is in the process of appointing a Chairperson of the Board and until now, there has never been any communication in relation thereto. We recently informed the Minister about the passing of Mr Madzivhandila, and the notification was met with silence.
7. I have resorted to Court as a last measure because previous attempts to communicate have been met with silence. The NLC had no alternative but to reached out to the President in an attempt to get the Minister to respond to our letters.
8. Whilst I take note that the Board recruitment process that has been initiated however, it is noteworthy to mention that appointment and vetting processes of office bearers in the NLC is highly contested, protracted and potentially litigious. A case in point is the position of the Chairperson of the Board, which remains vacant, notwithstanding the Minister's undertaking to the court on or about May 2021 to appoint a Chairperson upon conclusion of a Parliamentary process, therefore I require assurance that there will be a functioning Board on the $1^{\text {st }}$ of April 2022. Your letters were received after Court papers were issued due to your inaction on the issues raised in the Notice of Motion.
9. In the absence of a duly constituted Board, the NLC is hamstrung in fulfilling its statutory mandate and service delivery obligations to National Lottery participants and grant beneficiaries. Further, the sustainability of the Lotteries industry, National lottery and NLC operations is threatened.
10. It is against this background that I need the Court to be the custodian of the process of ensuring that a functioning Board is installed by the $1^{\text {st }}$ of April 2022.
11. I note the contents of your letter of even date, and I implore you as the Minister to give a written undertaking by close of business tomorrow, Friday $18^{\text {th }}$ March 2022 that there will be a functioning Board on the $1^{\text {st }}$ of April 2022 so that the hearing on Tuesday can simply be used to advise the Court that the issues raised in the Court papers are being resolved. To this effect, I attach a draft court order that can be handed up at Court on Tuesday, subject to your consent.

Yours Faithfully,

Ms Thabang Mampane
Commissioner: National Lotteries Commission

Cheadle Thompson \& HAYSOM INC. Attorneys

18 March 2022

Mr Eddison Mogane
Maluks Attorneys
Email: eddison@maluks.com
ioseph@maluks.com
lufuno@maluks.com

## Dear Mr Mogane

## National Lotteries Commission / Minister of Trade, Industry and Competition \& Another [HC Case No:15791/22]

1 We act for the Minister of Trade, Industry and Competition in this matter.
2 We refer to your client's letter dated 17 March 2022 received after close of business. Our client will be responding separately to your client.

3 We are instructed that our client will soon appoint a new Board, which will satisfy the requirements of the Lotteries Act.

4 In the circumstances, we propose that the matter be removed from the roll for Tuesday 22 March and be enrolled for another date prior to 31 March 2022.
5 If despite this, you insist on proceeding to apply for an order of court, we hereby give notice that we are instructed to file an extensive answering affidavit on behalf of the Minister. Further, the senior counsel who has advised the Minister extensively on this matter is not available on Tuesday at 10 h 00 and we will request that the matter be heard subsequently.

6 We await your urgent response by close of business today, and hold ourselves open to discuss this matter. In this regard, kindly contact Amogelang Makuwa on 0646845552.

Yours faithfully

Paul Benjamin
Cheadle Thompson \& Haysom Inc
(sent electronically without signature)

Johannesburg Nr: $\quad$ +27 (0) 103006128
Polokwane $\quad+27$ (0) 151010545
Mauritius $\quad+2302100507$
Fax Nr: $\quad+27(0) 866665249$
Email: helloomaluks.com
Web: www.maluks.com
CHEADLE THOMPSON AND HAYSOM INC
$5^{\text {TH }}$ FLOOR,

## LIBRIDGE

## 25 AMESHOFF STREET

BRAAMFONTEIN
JOHANNESBURG

By e-mail: Amogelang@cth.co.za
Paul@cth.co.za
Palesa@cth.co.za

## Your Ref

STA11003/P Benjamin

Our Ref

Date

ET Mogane/M00209
18 March 2022

Dear Mr, A Makuwa,

## RE: NATIONAL LOTTERIES COMMISSION / MINISTER OF TRADE, INDUSTRY AND COMPETITION \& ANOTHER CASE NO:15791/22

1. The above matter as well as the telephone discussion between yourself and the writer hereof on even date refers. We do not intend addressing every aspect raised in your letters under reply ad seriatim and our failure to do so should not be construed as admission of the correctness thereof but in fact the opposite.

Maluleke incorporated
Registration Number.
VAT Registration Number:
Directors:
Senior Associates:
Associates:

Attorneys | Notaries | Conveyancers | Forensic | Trademarks \& Patents | Tax 2019/304925/21 4760289076
Executive Chairman: MJ Maluleke LLB (UP), HDip Tax (UJ) Chief Executive PC Malemone CA (SA)
VC Williams BSC ENG (Mech) (HC), BProc (UNISA); JF Luterek B.Eng (Chemical) (UP) BProc (UNISA), H Shivamba LLB (UWC), ET Mogane LLB (UL) LLM (UP) TG Matij LLB (UNISA)
List of Directors available at the registered office or national website
2. As per the said telephone discussion, we attach herewith a proposed draft Court order for your client's consideration and written consent for it to be made an order of Court.
3. We see no reason why the matter should be postponed for argument on another date if a functioning would have been appointed on the $31^{\text {st }}$ of March 2022. Against this background, the matter will remain on the roll for 22 March 2022 for confirmation of the proposed draft Court order or hearing of our client's application.
4. Our client's rights remain strictly reserved.

## MALULEKE INC.



Per: E Mogane L Mathivha

Private Bag X84, PRETORIA, 0001, the dtic Campus, 77 Meintjies Street, Sunnyside, 0002, Tel: (012) 394 1480, Fax: +27 123940337 www.thedtic.gov.za

## Ms Thabang Mampane <br> Commissioner <br> National Lotteries Commission

## per email

## Dear Ms Mampane

## URGENT APPLICATION ON BOARD APPOINTMENTS

I am responding to your letter received after close of business on Thursday 17 March. As a result of pressing official engagements since early yesterday morning, it is not possible to respond fully to the specific issues raised in your letter and I reserve the right to do so in future. I wish therefore to respond only to a few specific issues.

First, the matter of the Board Chairperson and conflating the vacancy in the Chairperson post with appointments of ordinary members to the Board.

On several occasions in your letter (paragraphs 4, 6 and 8), you refer to the position of the Chairperson of the Board, stating that that position remains vacant. In paragraph 8 , you state that it is because I made an undertaking to the Court that I would appoint a Chairperson and have not done so, that you require an undertaking to the effect that I will appoint a Board by 1 April 2022.

The implication of this is that the non-appointment of the Chairperson provides a justification for your insistence on obtaining an order of court on the appointment of the Board itself, following the expiry of the period of office of incumbents.

For the record, it is therefore important for me to clarify the difference between the appointment of the Chairperson in terms of section 3(1)(a) of the Lotteries Act and the appointment of other board members in terms of section 3(1)(c).

As you are well aware, the effect of section $3(3)$ of the Lotteries Act is that the Chairperson can only be appointed under section $3(1)($ a) after the vacancy has been advertised in the Government Gazette and two newspapers, and after the relevant National Assembly Committee has made a recommendation to the Minister, after a transparent and open process for the consideration of nominations.

It is a matter of public record that the Parliamentary Portfolio Committee for Trade and Industry submitted the names of three candidates for my consideration to the National Assembly for its approval. During the litigation in May 2021 that you refer to it was assumed by all parties including the judge that the Parliamentary process, which had already been initiated at that time, would be finalised later that month. In terms of Parliamentary protocol and procedures, a recommendation by a portfolio committee such as that contemplated by section 3(3) of the Lotteries Act must be approved by the National Assembly. The names proposed by the Portfolio Committee on Trade and Industry have not yet been approved by the National Assembly and I am therefore not legally able to exercise my power under section $3(1)(a)$ to appoint a Chairperson. This is the consequence of a Parliamentary process, which I am advised the NLC monitors, and has no bearing on the process of appointing members under section $3(1)(\mathrm{c})$.

The reasons why I have not been able to appoint a Chairperson are a matter of public record and I am extremely surprised to hear your claim that you are not aware of this. In any event, the issue of the appointment of the Chairperson is not referred to in your founding affidavit in this matter, and is evidently included in your letter in what appears to be a disingenuous attempt to justify your insistence that I should agree to a court order. More pertinently, as Executive Authority, I am not similarly constrained in respect of the appointment of normal Board members.

Second, your letter raises a number of matters relating to correspondence and the issue of failure to advise the NLC of the issuing of an advert for appointment of Board members. I will not address the issues in this letter other than to note that the issuing of an advert is not a statutory requirement and is not a issue in respect of which the Commission has any executive function. In any event, your letter makes it clear you have been aware of the adverts and thus that the closing date had already passed and nevertheless you proceeded to a court application on the same matter without referring to this material fact in your founding affidavit to the attention of the Court.

It is therefore incorrect to state that there had been "inaction" on my part prior to the launch of your application. You were aware that I had taken certain actions and chose to ignore them.

It is clear from your letter that there was no factual or legal basis for approaching the Court on an urgent basis on 11 March in the manner that you did and seeking the relief that you did. In the light of the steps that have been taken and are being taken, there is no legal basis for the court to be approached to be the guardian of the process of establishing a board as you state in paragraph 10.

Accordingly, I do not consider it appropriate to consent to the draft order proposed.
In the event that you persist with the stance that the proposed draft order should be made an order of Court, I reiterate that I will oppose the granting of such relief. It will be therefore necessary for me to file an answering affidavit.

In that regard, as you have been advised the senior counsel who has been briefed, and who has advised me on these matters since their inception, is not available at $10 h 00$ on Tuesday, 22 March 2022. In this regard, I requested that it stand down on

[^2]Tuesday and be re-enrolled at a date suitable to the parties prior to 1 April 2022. I can see no reason why you should not have agreed to such a proposal.

In this regard, I repeat my request that our respective legal representatives liaise to resolve this.

Yours sincerely

Cheadle Thompson \& Haysom inc. Attorneys

23 March 2022

## Mr Eddison Mogane <br> Maluks Attorneys

Email: eddison@maluks.com

## Dear Mr Mogane

## National Lotteries Commission / The Minister of Trade, Industry and Competition \& Another [HC Case No.:15791/22]

1 We refer to your letter dated 18 March 2022 and your telephonic discussion with Amogelang Makuwa of our offices earlier today.

2 Please be advised that our client will today be appointing three persons to the Board of the National Lotteries Commission, in terms of section 3(1)(b) and one person in terms of section 3(1) (c) of the Lotteries Act, 1997. These appointments will be effective from 24 March 2022.
3 Our client will be addressing an appropriate letter to your client this evening, advising her of the names of the persons appointed to the Board.

4 In the circumstances, the need for your client's application falls away and we propose that it be withdrawn.

5 We await your urgent response.

Yours faithfully

## Paul Benjamin

Cheadle Thompson \& Haysom Inc.
(sent electronically without signature)

[^3]
## Ms Thabang Mampane <br> Commissioner <br> National Lotteries Commission

cc Ms Mpumi None

## Dear Ms Mampane

## Appointment of Board Members

Kindly be advised that I have appointed three persons to the Board of the National Lotteries Commission, in terms with sections 3(1)(c) read with section 3(4), and to the extent necessary section 3(6), of the Lotteries Act, 1997, as amended:

1. Ms Precious Mvulane, who meets the requirement to be a Chartered Accountant
2. Mr Willie Hofmeyer, who has been admitted as a legal practitioner; and
3. Ms Beryl Ferguson.

In addition, I have appointed one person to the Board of the National Lotteries Commission, in terms with sections $3(1)(b)$, read with section $3(4)$, and to the extent it may be necessary section 3(6) of the Lotteries Act, 1997, as amended:

## 1. Dr Cassius Lubisi

The terms of appointment of the four abovementioned persons are for the period from 24 March 2022 until 31 March 2023.

Prior to appointment, the abovementioned persons submitted to me signed declarations in terms of section 3B of the Lotteries Act, 1997, as amended.

I will arrange for my office to provide contact details of the new Board members.
Yours sincerely


Ebrahim Patel
Minister of Trade, Industry and Competition
23 March 2022


[^0]:    Lefapha la Dikgwebisano, Diintaseteri le TIholisano-Lefapha la Kgwebo Indasteri le Phadišhano - uMnyango wezoHwebo neZimboni kanye noMncintiswano - Muhasho wa zwa Mbambadzo, Makwevho na Muţaţisano. Die departement van handel, nywerneid en mededinging Kgoro ya Kgwebo Indasteri le Kgaisano • Ndzzwulo ya V uxavisi, Mabindzu na Mphikizano • Litiko leT ekuhweba tiMboni nekuncintiswano * ISebe lezoRhwebo noShishino kunye nokhuphiswano. UmNyango wezokuRhwebelana, amaBubulo nama Phatiswano

[^1]:    Lefapha la Dikgwebisano, Diintasetori le Tholisano-Lefapha la Kgwebo Indasteri le Phadišhano - uMnyango wezoHwebo neZimboni kanye noMncintiswano - Muhasho wa zwa Mbambadzo, Makwevto na Muţafisano. Die departement van handel, nywerheid en mededinging Kgoro ya Kgwebo Indasteri le Kgaisano - Ndzawulo ya V uxavisi, Mabindzu na Mphikizano • Litiko leT ekuhwaba tiMboni nekuncintiswano * ISebe lezoRhwebo noShishino kunye nokhuphiswano. UmNyango wezokuRhwebelana, amaBubulo nama Phaliswano

[^2]:    Lefapha la Dikgwebisano, Diintaseteri le Tholisano-Lefapha la Kgwebo Indasteri le Phadishano - uMnyango wezoHwebo neZimboni kanye noMncintiswano - Muhasho wa zwa Mbambadzo, Makwevho na Mujatisano - Die departement van handel, nywerheid en mededinging • Kgoro ya Kgwabo Indasteŕ le Kgaisano - Nazawulo ya V uxavisi, Mabindzu na Mphikizano • Litiko leT ekuhweba timboni nekuncintiswano ISebe lezoRhwebo noShishino kunye nokhuphiswano - UmNyango wezokuRhwebelana, amaBubulo nama Phaliswano

[^3]:    Cheadle Thompson . Haysom Inc. | Reg. No. 2000/0037|3/21 | Johannesburg | Cape Town
    Directors: NRL Haysom: PS Benjamin; BM Barry:TN Raditapole; GJ Doble: S Gaibie: RN Daniels: PS Masilo: HC Norval; K Naidoo; TC Gandidze; MR Makhura PM Msimanga: P Naidoo Consultant: D Ganasen / Senior Associates. B Ramjic NSS Lanto:A Makuwa: Ni Moleya Associates: YB Mti; KNVova
    Johannesburg: 5th Floor. Libridge. 25 Ameshoff Streec, Braamfontein, johannesburg, South Africa | PO Box: 30894, Braamfontein, 2017
    Tel: 0114032765 | Fax: 011403 1764| Docex: 50, johannesburg
    Cape Town: 28 ch Floor. The Box, 9 Riebeek Srreet, Cape Town. Souch Africa | FO Box: 15249 , Vlaeberg, 8018
    Tel: 0214182278 | Fax: 0214182279 | Docex:172. Cape Town
    Email: admin@eth.co.za / Web: www.cth,co,ra

